

A case study of Cloughjordan Eco-village, her resident and intending resident and the ideological, cultural, political, ecological and social discourses which frame their daily lives and their personal stories.

Supervisor: Dr. Maria Lichrou Student Name: Katherine Casey Student Number: 0717614

# **Table of Contents**

1	Intro	oduct	tion	1
2	Lite	ratur	e Review	4
	2.1 Consu		ical Consumption, Political Consumption, Resistant Consumption and Political	4
	2.2	Poli	tical Consumerism, Social Capital and Communities of Practice	6
	2.3	Eco	villages	8
	2.4	The	'Self'	9
	2.5	In S	ummary	10
3	Met	hodo	logy	11
	3.1	Intro	oducing the Cloughjordan Eco-village	11
	3.2	The	Journey to Cloughjordan Eco-village	12
	3.2.	1	Why a Case Study?	13
	3.3	Met	hodological Approach	14
	3.4	Data	a Collection	15
	3.4.	1	Access	16
	3.4.2	2	Researchers Journal	17
	3.4.	3	Phenomenological Interviews	18
	3.4.4	4	The Participants	19
	3.4.	5	Secondary Research	20
	3.5	Ana	lysis and Interpretation of Transcripts	20
	3.5.	1	Critical Discourse Analysis	20
	3.5.2	2	Analysing the Data	22
4	Find	lings	& Discussion	23
	4.1	Ideo	ology	24
	4.1.	1	A Political Consumerist Construction of Ethical Consumption	24
	4.1.2	2	Anti-Capitalist/Consumerist Discourses	26
	4.2	Con	nmunity	27
	4.2.	1	The Mythical Founder Story	29
	4.3	Ider	ntity	30
5	Con	clusi	on	34
6	Bibl	iogra	aphy	35
7	App	endi	x 1	41



# **1** Introduction

It has been said that we have now entered the era of the ordinary individual, that is to say an age in which any individual can - and must - take personal action, as to produce and show one's own existence, one's own difference.

(Cova and Cova 2002, 596)

Environmental, financial and social instability have marked the course of the past ten years, this is the 'era of the individual'. This era regards consumers as its predecessors regarded citizens, consumption decisions are politicised as consumer-citizens are called upon to recognise that their decisions have social and environmental implications (Crane 2010) Prothero et al. attribute this shift in belief system to a number of factors including the financial crisis and the creation of media activities concerning green issues, such as Al Gores *An Inconvenient Truth*, (2010).

The environment has stolen centre stage, the emergence of the environmental citizen places 'individuals as social actors who have key roles to play in making sustainable development work' (Hobson 2002, 101). One group of actors are attracting mounting attention as their number and visibility increases – the eco-villagers, those environmental crusaders forever in pursuit of an ecologically sound alternative. Whilst there is no doubt that ecovillages offer an alternative lifestyle it should be recognised that the ethos of the ecovillage runs much deeper, ecovillages herald the dawn of a new social movement, one which is defined by resistant consumption practices, rising in defiance of modern consumerism and globalisation (Litfin 2009, 1).

Thus far no research has been dedicated to the dominant Discourses and ideologies of the residents of eco-villages. In addressing this lacking, this research takes an Irish perspective and is located within Consumer Culture Theory (CCT). CCT is described as 'encouraging the investigation of the contextual, symbolic and experiential aspects of consumption and

possession and...analysis of these phenomena from macro-, meso-, and micro theoretical perspectives' (Arnould and Thompson 2005, p. 871).

The ecovillage has evolved in response to the reality that many of the ecological challenges faced by society today are the result of unsustainable consumption patterns. Governmental bodies and policy makers have struggled to create awareness regarding environmental issues in an attempt to urge individuals to take responsibility for their life styles (Hargreaves 2011, p. 80), the impact of their efforts is questionable however despite this an emergent international attitudinal shift has been discernible since the early (Macchiette and Roy 1994). This shift is mirrored by the development of the ecovillage community; in 1995 the Global Ecovillage Network was established.

At present there is no overarching definition of an eco-village; Gulstack Delambre presents Robert Gilman's as being the most 'widespread'. Gilman contends that an eco-village has four core elements it is a 'human scale and full-featured settlement (food, leisure, social life, education, business, residence) in which human activities are harmlessly integrated into the natural world (principle of ecology) in a way that is supportive of healthy human development and can be successfully continued into the indefinite future' (quoted by Gulstack Delambre 2010, 3). It could be argued that this definition is incomplete as it emphasises the technological elements of the ecovillage. This interpretive research, using critical discourse analysis reveals a rich community bound by a strong set of principles (some ecological, some social and some ideological) with a wealth of social capital fortified by a challenging common goal. The objective of this paper is to analyse the discourses and ideologies which inform the residents of Cloughjordan eco-village.

This paper is composed of the following three sections; the literature review which offers some theoretical background to this area, the findings and discussion which presents the

findings of this paper and finally the conclusion which summarises the research and makes some suggestions for future research.

### 2 Literature Review

Kilbourne and Beckmann identified three streams of environmentally related research conducted between 1971 and 1997 within the marketing literature. The first stream concerned the identification of a 'green' target market and the 'conceptualisation of green marketing in several aspects' (Kilbourne 2004, 188). The second phase explored "energy conservation and various legislative initiatives" (Kilbourne and Beckman, Review and Critical Assessment of Research on Marketing and the Envirnoment 1998, 15) and the final phase researched the individual, his/her motivations, perceived consumer effectiveness, cooperative alliances and strategic alliances (Kilbourne and Beckman 1998). The term green consumption appeared in 1994 (MORI, 1994) and was later extended to include other issues were obviously of concern (Newholm and Shaw 2007, 259) thus the term 'ethical consumption' was conceived. This research shall be located within the final phase described by Kilbourne and Beckmann, as it intends to look at the members of the Cloughjordan eco-village via the lens of political consumerism.

# 2.1 Ethical Consumption, Political Consumption, Resistant Consumption and Political Consumerism

Ritzer (2005) argues that 'the postmodern world is defined by consumption' (67). Postmodern society adulates choice and diversity; postmodern consumer behaviour is guided by identity (Haanpää 2007, Burke and Reitzes 1981) and as such consumption is imbued with cultural meaning drawn from wider discourses (Levy 1981, McCracken 1988). Consumption is 'viewed as a medium through which to construct an ethical life' (Clarke 2008, 1870). Shaw and Clarke (1999) criticise the tendency to profile environmentally conscious members of the public by employing personality measures or socio-demographic variables (Shaw and Clarke 1999). They described a need to ''look beyond simple relationships between discrete

variables and behaviour, to examine the link between consumer thought and action/inaction

more deeply' (Shaw and Clarke 1999, 110). They found that ethical consumers develop decision making processes which then become habit. The consumers were influenced by information; consciously sought information and raised their own awareness; they also looked to referents for guidance.

The term 'ethical consumer' has proven difficult to define (Freestone and McGoldrick 2008), this paper draws on Shaw and Riachs description which includes 'those who consider the environment, human and/or animal welfare as important and as a consequence evaluate their consumption lifestyles to take these issues into consideration' (2011, 1052).

The politicisation of consumption is an on-going academic discourse. 'As consumption becomes the 'new' activism political ecology narratives are increasingly shaping how 'alternative' consumption is understood' (Bryant and Goodman 2011, 344). What is termed 'ethical consumption' in one field is 'political consumption' in another and can be used interchangeably (Clarke 2008, 1074), however a distinction should be drawn between political consumption and political consumerism.

Michelle Micheletti expanded the term 'political consumerism', using it to describe 'consumer choice of producers and products based on a variety of ethical and political considerations' (Stolle et. al. 2003, 3). Stolle et. al. argue that meaningful use of this term requires three conditions: Political consumers must actually engage in the relevant *behaviours* (e.g. consumer resistant consumption, anti-consumption, culture jamming, each of which is a form of political consumerism), ethical or political considerations must have *motivated* their consumption decision and this type of consumption must be *frequent and habitual* (2010). Political consumerism is a form of political participation which manifests itself as citizen-based, market orientated action - *individualised collective action* (Humphrey 2010, 57-58).

In his book on political theory and social movements Opp reviews several definitions of the term 'social movement' and considers the factors which determine a social movement. From this discussion he derived a definition for a 'protect group' which he argues is a social movement blessed with longevity. 'A protest group is ... a collectivity of actors who want to achieve their shared goal or goals by influencing decisions of a target' (Opp 2009, 41). Bossy (2011) defines political consumerism as a social movement and it is contended that she is correct in her assertion. Political consumerism fulfils all of the requirements denoted by Opp. Binkley also offers support for this contention implying that this is a social movement which falls outside of 'the categories defined by traditional politics' being 'derive[d] from people's increasing self-awareness of personal experiences and daily practices' (2009, 98)<sup>1</sup>. Further it is argued that Michelettis definition of political consumerism includes the eco-village movement as their behaviour could be described as *individualised collective action* and it meets all three conditions detailed by Stolle et. al. (2003).

# 2.2 Political Consumerism, Social Capital and Communities of Practice

Neilson and Paxton (2010) provide 'detailed rationale for how social capital can be leveraged to empower consumers. They argue that there is an important (and unexplored) connection between social capital and political consumerism (Neilson and Paxton 2010).

Social Capital is the sum of the actual and potential resources embedded within, available through, and derived from the network of relationships possessed by an individual or social unit. Social capital thus comprises both the network and the assets that may be mobilized through that network.

(Nahapiet and Ghoshal 1998, 243)

Neilson and Paxton offer a theoretical explanation for the argument that 'trust and associations provide motivations and information that empower consumers to take action for social change through their purchase decision' (2010, 19). This explanation includes the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This type of politics is called 'subpolitics', Micheletti has described the subpolitical as 'responsibility-taking by citizens in their everyday, individual orientated life arena that cuts across the public and private spheres**Invalid source specified.** 

dissemination of information via social networks and motivators including the group norms, informal ties and elevated levels of trust for both institutions and individuals<sup>2</sup>. Their empirical data supports their contentions proving that association membership positively influences political consumerism (Neilson and Paxton 2010).

High levels of social capital in ecovillages have been reported; Kirby (2003) identified this as one of five forms of connectedness which exist in Ithaca ecovillage. Social capital was defined by Robert Putman as 'connections among individuals – social networks and the norms of reciprocity and trustworthiness that arise from them' (Putman 2000, 19). Mechanisms which generate social capital include reciprocity expectations and group enforcement of norms, the consequences or benefits of its possession are numerous and include privileged access to information and a strong network of people willing to help and the "appropriable" social organization that provided the context for both sources and effects to materialize. (Portes 1998, 5)

COPs are social learning systems (Wenger 2000) which facilitate the exchange of both explicit and tacit knowledge (beliefs, opinions, lore expressed as story, sensibilities); they are based on trust, empathy and reciprocity (Preece 2004). Members are bound by a collective understanding of their community, a strong set of 'norms' and values, a common vernacular and 'a shared repertoire of communal resources, language, routines, sensibilities, artefacts, tools, stories (Wenger 2000, 237). Social capital is a product of COPs. Eckert and McConnell-Ginet describe a COP as

[A]n aggregate of people who, united by a common enterprise, develop and share ways of doing things, ways of talking, beliefs and values – in short, practices...The development of shared practices emerges as the participants make meaning of their joint enterprise, and of themselves in relation to this enterprise.

(Eckert and Mcconnell-Ginet 1999, 186)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Higher levels of general trust are found amongst those who are in receipt of social capital

Interestingly Woodruff et. al. (1998), in their study of 'home greeners' revealed a community which offered support, information and an unofficial mentoring programme to participants. The authors did not allude to COPs however it is difficult not to draw a correlation between COPs and the community portrayed.

Gulstack Delambre presented eco-villages as COPs at the Second Conference on Economic Degrowth in 2010 (Gulstack Delambre 2010).

#### 2.3 Ecovillages

Kirby (2003) 'examines the blend of social vision and ideological and personal factors' (p. 323) upon which the eco-village in Ithaca, New York was founded. The research identified that the desire to create the community was predominantly derived from a wish to connect with other like-minded individuals, an opportunity to deviate from the accepted social mode, concern for the environment and to confirm a 'self-identity as a socially or environmentally concerned individual' (Kirby 2003, p.327).

According to Moisander and Pesonen's (2002) ethnographic study on the behaviour of the residents of four communes all of which were built around the concept of sustainable living, communards had found it impossible to act as moral agents in society and so had moved to communes in order to live in a manner they found more appealing (Moisander and Pesonen 2002, 329). Moisander and Pesonen (2002) also found the participants shared a 'desire to change the world' (338), and so they offered their way of life as an example for the rest of society, Moisander and Pesonen termed this 'resistance by not resisting'(338). A similar phenomenon was identified by Woodruff et al. in their interpretive study of the motivations, practices and experiences of over 35 householders who had modified their current homes or constructed new 'green' homes in order to 'inform the design of future sustainable technologies'. They identified emergent themes using affinity clustering on data collected via semi structured interviews and they used discourse analysis to analyse photographs of the

houses (Woodruff et al. 2008, 314). They concluded that 'many participants had built a distinctive identity based on the fact that they saw themselves as separate from the 'wasteful masses'' (Woodruff et al. 2008, 319) and that in fact the participants often actively sought to separate themselves from society as a whole. Woodruff et al. found that many of the participants were 'living by example', they believed that their decision to build an ecologically sound home and allow others to view it would influence others to follow in their footsteps – Woodruff termed this as 'activism by example' (318). Litfin (2009) refers to this aspect of the eco-village movement as 'building alternative systems rather than simply opposing existing ones' (128) thus endowing it with strong political qualities.

# 2.4 The 'Self'

Impression management is employed in order to 'maximise one's reward-cost ratio in social relations...enhance one's self esteem, and...faciliate the development of desired identities' (Leary and Kowalski 1999, 37). People are motivated to engage in impression management in order to fulfil the above 'goals', it is theorised that 'motivation increases as a function of the value or importance of desired goals' (Beck 1983) and when there is a 'discrepancy between the desired self and current image' (Leary and Kowalski 1999, 39).

People project impressions which mirror how they view themselves – their self-concepts (Leary and Kowalski 1999). Impression management is also influenced desirable identity image refers to what one would 'like to be and thinks he or she really can be' (Leary and Kowalski 1999, 40) therefore the images presented are biased toward this desired identity. In addition people tend to ensure that the image they present is inconsistent with undesired identities.

It is long accepted that the self-concept, identity and symbolic consumption are inextricably linked (Levy 1959). It is acknowledged that '[p]eople consume in ways that enhance their self-concepts while simultaneously avoiding objects that could add undesired meaning to their

lives' (Lee et. al. 2009, 170). The concept of the undesired self has been explored in relation to anti-consumption (Lee et. al. 2009, Cherrier 2007, Hogg et. al. 2009), boycotting (Sandıkc and Ekici 2008) and etihical consumption (Moraesa et.al. 2010) but never in relation to membership of an eco-village.

Bucholtz and Hall (2010) define identity as 'the social positioning of the self and other' (18), they argue that it is constituted via social action and language and that people draw on 'structures' such as ideology (or a Discourse) in order to construc their identity. They recognise that identity operates on a number of levels – encompassing 'macrolevel demographic categories, local ethnographically specific cultural postions and temprorary and interactioanlly specific stances' (21).

Both Woodruff et. al. (2008) and Kirby (2003) refer to 'identity' in their respective papers. Identity is created within discourses, thus identity is derived from society as a result people often engage in behaviour they deem appropriate for the discourse in which they wish to belong, they 'self symbolise' (Leary and Kowalski 1999).

# 2.5 In Summary

The above studies demonstrate that these issues are interconnected. This eco-village could be conceived as a community of practice promoting political consumerism. The social capital generated by the members of the ecovillage perpetuates this movement which in turn informs the construction of the members' identities as 'members of Cloughjordan eco-village' and all that this entails. All of the research streams mentioned informs the research being conducted in Cloughjordan eco-village.

# 3 Methodology

### 3.1 Introducing the Cloughjordan Eco-village

Cloughjordan eco-village is located in County Tipperary, 57 kilometres north-west of Limerick. It is a 'model of sustainable living' (The Village 2010) in which the way of life is described as being 'healthy, satisfying and socially-rich while minimising

ecological impacts' (The Village 2010). Some of the features of the eco-village include a landscape design 'based on principles of



Location of Cloughjordan (The Village 2010)

environmental and ecological diversity, productive landscape and permaculture' (The Village 2010), low energy homes, a renewable energy centre, woodland gardens, a community farm, a green enterprise centre, an educational centre and a strong community of diverse people. In September of 2011 24 buildings were complete and 30 were under construction.

The eco-village is far more than a green housing estate; it is a community of people in the truest sense. There are civic spaces and buildings for the use of the community as the ecovillage is 'owned' by all of her members; they are shareholders in company called Sustainable Projects Ireland Limited (SPIL) trading as "The Village". SPIL is limited by guarantee and bound by articles of association which ensures that it acts as a cooperative. The members have subscribed to the paradigm of self-organisation and therefore share all the responsibilities associated with the ecovillage (Village 2011).

SPIL is also registered as an educational charity; the following mission statement is contained in the company's memorandum of association.

The Village will serve as a model for sustainable living into the 21<sup>st</sup>. century and will serve as an enterprise, research and service resource for all. The company will demonstrate a socially, economically and ecologically viable community that will promote its work and findings through a variety of media and educational programs developed by the company.

(Village 2011)

The objective of this research is to develop an understanding of the Cloughjordan Ecovillage

resident and intending resident, the ideological, cultural, political, ecological and social

discourses which frame their daily lives and their personal stories.

# 3.2 The Journey to Cloughjordan Eco-village

The day I travelled to the Tipperary village of Cloughjordan was bright, as bright as any day in August, the motorway through rolling hills surrendered to meandering roads which lead to a small village surrounded on all sides by a green lushness which can only be experienced in a climate such Irelands. Cloughjordan is truly the ideal location for an eco-village, aesthetically at least.

I arrived at 1pm on Friday the 12<sup>th</sup> of August. I found the eco-village off the main street, through two gate posts, and down a slight slope. Once you pass through the gates you are greeted by a narrow lane which is littered with signs stating that pedestrians have the right of way within the eco-village, the first reminder that you are now entering privately owned land, land which is governed by rules which differ to those applied to the rest of society. I emerged at the end of the passage, in an open space encircled by houses at every stage of construction. I was immediately struck by the homes which were taking shape, they were more than merely unusual, they were almost unique.

My first participant occupied a bright pink house at the end of a row of similarly coloured cottage like residences. They were both exactly what I had anticipated and in stark contrast to my assumptions in a strange amalgam of rebellious conformity. Moon shaped steps lead to an arched door which opened into a bright porch; the first of my interviewees welcomed me into a home of which she was obviously proud. Proud of the spiral wooden staircase which twisted its way from the hall upwards into the heart of the house and the glassless window lined wall between the kitchen and the hall, of the open plan living area, shaped like an eye or a lunar eclipse, and the dazzlingly white walls which reminded me of this projects youth and all of the hopeful idealism which it bears. This is Cloughjordan Eco-villages, bright, young and most importantly, impossibly optimistic.

(Researchers Journal, 1)

From the moment of its conception this has been an iterative study, it was borne of a desire to understand the Irish ethical consumer. The term 'ethical consumer' is difficult to define for example some people may consider themselves to be ethical because they purchase recycled paper (Tallontire et.al. 2001, 18.). It was decided to overcome this problem by identifying a group of individuals readily identifiable as dedicated ethical consumers. Cloughjordan eco-village has been promoted as a 'model for sustainable living' (The Village 2010)

sustainability and ethical consumption are intrinsically linked therefore interviewing the residents of Cloughjordan eco-village was deemed to be the best solution to this issue. Originally it was proposed to study the eco-villagers motivations however following the first visit to Cloughjordan eco-village it became apparent that the eco-villagers motivations were deeply engrained in their personalities and informed by a common discourse which was embedded in their understanding of reality and as such it became impossible (and impractical) to try and isolate them. As a result of this finding the research question had to be reformulated and a case-study emerged from it ashes.

It is Friday night, today I visited and interviewed two eco-village residents, I have retired early to gather my thoughts. As I sit here and try to understand what I have learned today I realise that today's events have disillusioned me, my assumptions have been completely dismembered and I finally understand that, until now, I have misunderstood this project and the people whose lives it has absorbed. This is more than a consumption decision, it is a lifestyle choice, an attempt to live ethically, not just to consume ethically. These people have not consumed an eco-village, it has consumed them.

(Researchers Journal, 2)

Cloughjordan Eco-village had been chosen as the subject of this case study as it is the only eco-village in Ireland as such it offers a unique context in which to study both the consumption practices of Irish ethical consumers this reasoning endured however the study became a case study of Irish eco-villagers, reality as they perceive it and the emergent social movement.

# 3.2.1 Why a Case Study?

This research is presented as a case study because it is the most appropriate research strategy. Yin (1981) states that the case study 'attempts to examine (a) a contemporary phenomenon in its real-life context, especially when (b) the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident' (Yin, The Case Study Crisis: Some Answers 1981, 59). He later goes on to add that the case study should be used when 'examining contemporary events...when the relevant behaviours cannot be manipulated' (Yin 2009, 11). These criteria are applicable to this research.

Case studies can be used to 'understand complex social phenomena' (Yin 2009, 4) this is important as the eco-village is a world-wide phenomenon which warrants research. This shall require an analysis of the individual, the community and the relevant dominant discourses. Stake (1995) differentiates between intrinsic and instrumental case studies. This study falls into the latter; providing some general insights (3) which can be applied to a larger topic. The object of any qualitative study is theory generation (Hesse-Biber and Leavy 2011, 255) and case studies are an effective way of achieving this, 'they act as clear examples of new relationships, new orientations, or new phenomena that current theory and theoretical perspectives have not captured' (Dyer and Wilkins 1991, 617).

It is a widely held belief that the theory generated from single case studies is not generalizable (Pierre 2005, 454) this is arguably counterbalanced by the case study's ability to evaluate the complex relationships, discourses and social context within a community. Flyvbjerg (2006) argues that 'it is incorrect to conclude that one cannot generalise from a single case' (225).

### 3.3 Methodological Approach

There is a dearth of literature generating knowledge based on quantitative research methods in relation to ethical decision making and consumption however there is very little qualitative research (e.g. Kirby 2003, Freestone and McGoldrick 2008, Szmigin et. al. 2009) despite the fact these phenomena are postmodern concepts. The eco-village is also borne of a postmodern society and as such should be studied using postmodern qualitative theoretical approaches.

This qualitative study has been approached from the interpretive perspective; this approach focuses on 'understanding, interpretation and social meaning...interpretive approaches

presuppose meaning is constructed between humans or between humans and objects' (Hesse-Biber and Leavy 2011, 17). This is important as this view reflects the researcher's world view. The aim of this research is to develop a deep understanding of the participants' behaviour, beliefs, opinions and emotions from the participants' perspectives, to understand how the participants experience life in Cloughjordan (Hennink, Hutter and Bailey 2011, 11). In order to achieve this it was decided to adopt a phenomenological perspective. At a philosophical level phenomenological study is interested in understanding social reality – how people create an understanding of social life, at a methodological level it is used to capture the 'lived experience' of individuals (Hesse-Biber and Leavy 2011, 19).

Practitioners of this type of research recognise that it is important to be sensitive to the context in which their research takes place, actually going to the Eco-village, visiting the members of the eco-village and participating in their board meeting generated an understanding of the context, the particular situation and environment in which this phenomenon is taking place (Maykut and Morehouse 1994, 13).

Methodologies, such as phenomenological interviewing, are the product of paradigmatic allegiances. Thompson et. al. define a paradigm as 'a group of researchers sharing common assumptions about the nature of reality, utilising common methodologies and dealing with similar problems' (1989, 133). They apply the paradigm of existential phenomenology to the study of consumer experience. It is argued that this study falls within the realm of consumer experience.

# 3.4 Data Collection

This research was informed by an array secondary research. Podcasts and YouTube videos about Cloughjordan eco-village created an opportunity to develop a relationship with the people involved in the project, their objectives and outlook. Newspaper and magazine articles provided information about how the eco-village is perceived both within Cloughjordan and on

a national level and The Village website painted a picture of how the eco-villagers see themselves. In order to collect data for the case study it was necessary to 'enter the field'. The researcher spent three days in Cloughjordan eco-village. The data collection included a researcher's journal which recorded observations, impressions and some conversations and interviews.

## 3.4.1 *Access*

Gaining access to the group was somewhat more difficult than anticipated it took several months to negotiate the terms of the trip to Cloughjordan Eco-village. It was necessary to attain formal permission from the community appointed gatekeeper. The proposal had to be rewritten on several occasions before it was deemed acceptable to the community gatekeeper. A combination of purposive sampling and snowball sampling was used in order to gain access to the group. In time the gatekeeper became a key participant (Hesse-Biber and Leavy 2011, 201-202). Three of the participants offered to be interviewed after the education representative sent an email to everyone in Cloughjordan eco-village mailing list the remainder offered to take part at the board meeting.

Although this research does not pertain to anything of an extremely personal nature it does delve into the participant's ideologies and personal histories and therefore every care was taken to ensure that none of the participants were at any risk at any time. Each interviewee was fully informed of the research topic before the interview began and each one signed form stating as such, as suggested by Thompson et. al. (1989, 138)<sup>3</sup>.

Communication is an important element of this process, it was necessary to manage the participants' perceptions as regards what was actually being researched. Several of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> All ethical standards have been met, the recordings of the interviews, their transcripts and all related notes are secured in a password protected file, there are no hard copies in existence and the signed consent forms are in a locked filing cabinet.

participants had already been the subject of research, the results of some of which had been somewhat negative therefore some of the respondents were apprehensive about answering any questions which were 'off topic' in their opinion.

I acknowledged that I had read the article in question and I made it clear that I did not agree with the author. The atmosphere turned immediately from one of contention to one of acceptance. I was struck by the negative impact that this article had on the residents, how hurt they were and I suddenly understood, what I had inferred to be malice was in fact fear, it was as if they had been betrayed once and were now guarded, I understood this and endeavoured to respect it.

(Researchers Journal, 4)

In addition much of the research conducted in Cloughjordan eco-village seems to be related to how the buildings have been constructed, the materials used, their design and so forth one of the respondents was under the impression that this information was required.

The risk of inappropriate behaviour towards the researcher is one issue which is rarely considered in relevant material. Whilst conducting one of the interviews for this case study a situation arose during which a male interviewee made inappropriate overtures once the dictaphone had been turned off. This is an area which should be highlighted to both male and female researchers.

#### 3.4.2 Researchers Journal

A research journal proved useful as a record of events, recurring words and phrases (Maykut and Morehouse 1994, 68). An invaluable tool when analysing and collecting the data it served as a diary of thoughts, ideas and feelings experienced throughout the period spent in the ecovillage and throughout the researching process. Keeping a reflexive diary not only facilitated simultaneous observation and analysis (Hesse-Biber and Leavy 2011, 215) and flexibility but also created the opportunity to examine assumptions, mistakes and findings through reflexivity. Reflexivity or 'writing to learn' (Kleinsasser 2000, 158) is an essential component of qualitative research. Kleinsasser (2000) describes reflexivity as making 'thinking visible' and went on to say that '[w]hen thinking becomes visible, it can be inspected, reviewed, held

up for consideration, and viewed as a set of data' (158). Reflexivity has played a significant role in the course of this research as it highlighted and dispelled all assumptions which developed in the initial research stage. As a result of reflexivity the question was reviewed and altered somewhat after the initial interviews.

#### 3.4.3 Phenomenological Interviews

Phenomenological interviewing or in-depth interviewing is designed to 'attain a first person description of some specified domain of experience' (Thompson et. al. 1989, 138) in this case the experience of moving to Cloughjordan eco-village and what life there entails. This type of interviewing was used to conduct six interviews at which point it became apparent that no new relevant data was being produced. Phenomenological studies require the researcher to study a small number of subjects however interviews are generally quite long (Creswell 1994, 12). The majority of the interviews were over an hour long with the exception of one forty minute interview.

The position of the interviewer and participant in phenomenological interviewing is one of equality; the interviewer should not imagine that he or she is more knowledgeable than the participant (Thompson et. al. 1989, 138). In order to achieve this Thompson et. al. (1989) issue guidelines the first of which is to establish oneself as a non-directive listener, they argue that this is achieved by not asking the question 'why?' and by having questions 'follow from respondent discourse' (Thompson et. al. 1989, 139).

In order to attain descriptions of the participants experiences in and with Cloughjordan ecovillage it was necessary to develop relationship of trust this was achieved by ensuring that the interviews or conversations took place in comfortable familiar locations and by assuring them that all care would be taken to ensure their anonymity (Cherrier 2005, 601).

The participants were asked one 'grand tour' question (Creswell 1994, 70) which asked the participants to 'describe' their journey to Cloughjordan eco-village. This was followed by probes in order to gain further insights and clarifications (Maykut and Morehouse 1994, 94) of participants consumption experiences and their personal history thereby generating narratives. Any subsequent questions focussed on their values and interpretations. No two interviews were the same, or even similar, as each participant recounted a different journey personal to themselves.

In order to understand the members of Cloughjordan eco-village it was necessary to understand that this was a group of individuals which is engulfed in their own ideologies, they have created their own culture, stories, myths and lexicon, they were a community which would 'tell stories with words and meanings that are specific to their experience and way of life' (Jovchelovitch and Bauer 2000, 1)and these 'narrations preserve particular perspectives in more genuine form' (Jovchelovitch and Bauer 2000, 1).

Participant No.	Sex	Age	Resident/Intending Resident	Involved since:
Noreen	F	60+	R	2001
Thomas	М	60+	Ι	2002
Louise	F	45-55	Ι	2005
Richie	М	35-45	R	2002
Enda	М	35-45	R	1998
Keith	М	60+	R	1999

#### 3.4.4 The Participants

#### 3.4.5 Secondary Research

Youtube Videos	There are many youtube videos relating to Cloughjordan
	ecovillage from the prospective of the founders, the members
	and the local Cloughjordan residents.
	There ar numerous promotional Videos for Cloughjordan Ecovillage.
	There are also a number of mini documentaries on ecovillages.
Newspaper & Magazine Articles	There are a number of newspaper and magazine articles about
	The Village.
The Village Website	Community literature is available on The Village Website
Alternative Websites	There are other webpages which offer information on
	Cloughjordan Ecovillage from both negative and positive perspectives.
Podcasts	There are a number of very informative podcasts about
	Cloughjordan ecovillage and other ecovillages. There is also an the
	ecovillage radio station which podcasts about various related issues.
Memorandum of Association	This document includes The Villages aims and objectives.

# 3.5 Analysis and Interpretation of Transcripts

# 3.5.1 Critical Discourse Analysis

Narrative, language, social practices and hegemony are the province of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) which focuses on 'understanding how language is used to construct and change aspects of the world' (Saunders, Lewis and Thornhill 2009, 513) change is the preserve of Cloughjordan eco-village, it is the very reason for its existence and this alone determined that CDA was the most appropriate method of analysis. Gee defines discourse as 'ways of combining and integrating language, actions, interactions, ways of thinking, believing, valuing and using various symbols, tools and objects to enact a particular sort of socially recognisable identity' (Gee 2005, 21). Fairclough (2003) states that he sees discourse analysis as

'Oscillating between a focus on specific texts and a focus on what I call the 'order of discourse', the relatively durable social structuring of language which is itself one element of the relatively durable structuring and networking of social practices. Critical discourse

analysis is concerned with continuity and change at this more abstract, more structural, level, as well as with what happens in particular texts'

(Fairclough 2003, 3)

Starks and Brown Trinidad simplify this somewhat during their discussion of discourse analysis (DA) stating that discourse analysts argue that

'language and words, as a system of signs, are in themselves essentially meaningless; it is through the shared, mutually agreed on use of language that meaning is created. Language both mediates and constructs our understanding of reality. It also defines the social roles that are available to individuals and serves as the primary means through which they enact their identities.'

(Stark and Brown Trinidad 2007, 1374)

Hopkinson (2003) brings this further and states that given this the role of language in the construction of reality language should be studied independently rather as a mere indicator of something deemed more sociologically interesting (1946). Similar to poststructuralism, DA recognises that language houses innate power relations and their all of their ideological associations (Catterall and Maclaran 2006, 234).

CDA is discourse analysis with an added dimension. Wodak (1995) described the aim of CDA as being to analyse "opaque as well as transparent structural relationships of dominance, discrimination, power and control as manifested in language" (1995, 50). She goes on to differentiate between DA and CDA;

A fully 'critical' account of discourse would require a theorization and description of both the social processes and structures which give rise to the production of a text, and of the social structures and processes within which individuals or groups as social-historical subjects create meanings in their interaction with texts.

(Wodak 1995, 50)

As a result CDA will always revolve around three concepts; power, history and ideology (Wodak 1995, 50), all of which are manifest in the very nature of Cloughjordan eco-village, as evidenced in the findings and discussion.

#### 3.5.2 *Analysing the Data*

Qualitative research generates rich data, and it is this richness which makes the data difficult to analyse and interpret. 'Interpretive analysis is an iterative, inductive process of decontextualization and recontextualization' (Stark and Brown Trinidad 2007, 1375), this means that the researcher must separate the data from its context and assign codes to 'units if meaning' within the text (decontextualisation). Recontextualisation is the examination of the codes for patterns and the reduction of the data to central themes (Stark and Brown Trinidad 2007, 1375); this is achieved via categorisation and abstraction (Spiggle 1994, 493).

The transcripts were analysed and interpreted using an iterative process and the approach recommended by Spiggle (1994). She defined 'categorisation' as 'the process of classifying or labelling units of data' (493) or coding. Once the interviews were transcribed into a word document and then copied into an excel sheet, each clause onto a separate line in order to make it easier to analyse. Each sentence was then analysed using Gee's seven building tasks, significance, activities, identities, relationships, politics, connections and sign systems and knowledge (2005, 11-13).

As the research was being conducted a number of 'themes' and 'subthemes' emerged, each of these were then given codes which were then used to 'categorise' the data. Once the data was coded the data was tabulated, each theme was described in detail. This was an iterative process which involved returning to the transcripts repeatedly in order to develop the categories.

# 4 Findings & Discussion

Barker and Galasnski (2001) cite Norman Fairclough as stating that CDA 'perceives discourse, both written and spoken as a form of social practice...discourse is constitutive of and constituated by social and political realites' (64-65)<sup>4</sup>. It is these social and political realities which are of interest in this analysis. It is argued by Barker and Galasnski that ideologies are formed, re-produced and reinforced through language.

Ideologies shape Discourses, which Barker and Galasnski (2001) posit as 'a site of power struggle in which the ideologies implicated by discursive choices are the subject of struggles for dominance within and between social groups' (67).

This paper shall draw on Van Dijks (1995) defition of ideology

Ideologies are basic frameworks of social cognition, shared by members of social groups, constituted by relevant selections of sociocultural values, and organized by an ideological schema that represents the self-definition of a group. Besides their social function of sustaining the interests of groups, ideologies have the cognitive function of organizing the social representations (attitudes, knowledge) of the group, and thus indirectly monitor the group-related social practices, and hence also the text and talk of members.

Analysis of the interviews revealed that dominant ideologies and Discourses within the ecovillage operated on three distinct levels.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In this context 'discourse' means narrative . In order to differentiate this type of discourse shall be not be capitalised.

# 4.1 Ideology

A CDA relevant the interview revealed that the dominant ideology within Cloughjordan

Ecovillage is that of political consumerism.

# 4.1.1 A Political Consumerist Construction of Ethical Consumption

- 1. I tend not to like term/ $^{5}$
- 2. [ethical consumer] because it's like a light green..
- 3. it's like don't worry about the system, //
- 4. you don't need to change it you just need to shop differently//
- 5. you know so an ethical consume ..
- 6. of course//
- 7. I'm an ethical consumer, I'll chose fair trade,//
- 8. I want to have relationship with the people who produce my food//
- 9. there are things I want to avoid things that have had a lot of energy spent on them//
- 10. high energy goods//
- 11. that's an ethical consumer.//
- 12. But that's always a process of learning//
- 13. I mean we're not just looking//
- 14. it's not just buying fair trade instead of normal coffee//
- 15. it is about thinking a bit deeper about these things//
- 16. and how we use our pound or euro.// (Enda)

Enda's construction of the term 'ethical consumer' is extremely revealing. He distances himself from what he regards as a 'light green' form of consumption. The third and fourth lines offer an explanation for this disdain, ethical consumption is represented as an evasive measure which allows consumers to ignore the bigger issue, the fact that 'the system' is in need of change (the founding tenet of political consumerism (Micheletti and Follesdal 2007)) Thus he simultaneously denigrates 'ethical consumption' and privileges stronger forms of political consumerism.

In the following lines (7-10) he introduces fair trade, anti-consumption and localisation as superior alternatives to ethical consumption<sup>6</sup>. Anti-consumption and localisation feature heavily in the eco-villages discourse. Enda depicts a desire to have a 'relationship with the people who produce' his food. In Cloughjordan this aspiration is realised, a community farm produces organic food which is available to the entire local community, thus subverting the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>// indicates a line is said with a final tone contour and (..) indicates a pause (Gee 2005).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> All of which are forms of political consumerism.

'global economic' system. Food localisation is essentially the process of cutting the food chain, the shorter the chain the 'greener' the product (Morgan 2010). The impact of localisation is evidenced by the growing number of community supported agriculture schemes, small scale alternative food growers and even farmers markets (Allen and Hinrichs 2007). North (2010) describes the movements primary petition – 'economic decisions should focus not on profit maximisation and economic efficiency to the exclusion of all else, but on meeting needs as locally as possible' (586).

- 1. We always would try to buy local, even down to tradesmen//
- 2. you know, we try to source them locally//
- 3. keep the local economy//
- 4. as opposed to buying it on e-bay for a bit less// (Richie)

This concept echoes throughout the eco-village. The members consciously participate in the local economy. This bridge to the local community is a trait which is typical to eco-villages, Dawson (2006) likens eco-villages to a 'yoghurt culture: small, dense and rich concentrations of activity whose aim is to transform the nature of that which surrounds them' (6).

Enda's avoidance of unethical produce is a form of anti-consumption, a deep-seated discourse within the eco-village culture. When Thomas was asked whether he considered himself to be a 'green, ethical or anti-consumer?' he responded;

- 1. Yes, yes and yes. ,//
- 2. And anti-consumer is actually is quite important//
- 3. very much//
- 4. I mean one of the best//
- 5. most ethical consumption decision when purchasing is 'don't buy'// (Thomas)

In the second line Thomas privileges the anti-consumer. In lines 4-5 Thomas offers anticonsumption as being the 'most ethical consumption decision' thus lending support to Enda's position and devaluing 'ethical consumption' as a tool of social change.

Line 12 is interesting as Enda recognises that ethical consumption is part of the 'learning process'. In using the plural pronoun 'we' Enda forms a connection between himself and this

process, this is not surprising as he is deeply involved in the educational aspect of Cloughjordan ecovillage. Education is one of the cornerstones of this community.

- 1. But ours is educational the **project was set up**//
- 2. to provide a model for future development//
- 3. specifically for Ireland//
- 4. although hopefully some of the lessons will be for other places as well//
- 5. and, am, that's what the whole thing is designed around//
- 6. that's what drives it// (Thomas)

Thomas is emphatic about the fact that eco-village was established as a model, and that this

objective is its driving force. This educational aspect has been identified as a form of

activism by both Woodruff et. al. (2008) and Moisander and Pesonen (2002. Dubuisson-

Quellier et. al. elaborate describing this pursuit as a repertoire of protest associated with social

movements (2011).

# 4.1.2 Anti-Capitalist/Consumerist Discourses

Another discourse prevalent<sup>7</sup> within political consumerism is that of anti-capitalism and anti-

consumerism. Thomas used the linguistic tool 'intertextuality'<sup>8</sup> to effectively convey his

opinion which was informed by popular discourse model<sup>9</sup> condemning advertising,

consumerism, capitalism and television. He describes a piece of graffiti which he recently

witnessed.

- 1. But It showed a TV screen, the old sort with bunny ears aerial on top//
- 2. radio waves coming out, sort of hypnotic you know?//
- 3. There were three TV screens in a line//
- 4. with faces on them//
- 5. the first one was saying 'Obey'//  $% \left( \frac{1}{2}\right) =0$
- 6. then 'conform'//
- 7. 'consume' under each of them//(Thomas)

In lines 1 and 2 Thomas portrays the TV in a manner which could be described as menacing,

it has been given humanistic features – a face and a mind (capable of hypnotism). It is clear

from the commands which he later lists (lines 5-7) that the TV is a 'personification' of a

combination of the advertising industry, capitalism and consumerism.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> All six interviewees held anti-capitalist and anti-consumerism views

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> 'The juxtaposition of different texts' (Bloome and Egan-Robertson 1993, 305)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Unconscious theories used to make sense of texts and the world (Gee 2005).

The fact that Thomas references graffiti (an age old forum of political commentary (McGlynn 1972)) evidences his political sympathetic. His interpretation of the artwork is also very telling. Drawing on the above discourse model he refers to the radio waves as being 'hypnotic', this in tandem with the commands being issued by the TV depict a consumer society dominated by capitalist advertisers.

Noreen also uses intertextuality to convey a similar message, however she does so more literally. In the following extract she is discussing the impact of consumerism and capitalism on society.

- 1. [I]t's like they said about the riots in England //
- 2. somebody said the other day//
- 3. they're being told by the television//
- 4. 'you need these runners'//
- 5. 'you need this kind of a dress' //
- 6. 'you need this gadget // (Noreen)

Noreen also personifies and then vilifies the television (line 3), she does not say who the voice really belongs to (it does not belong to the inanimate object that is the television) however she does disclose what is being said. This is doubtlessly the utterance of the capitalist advertiser depicted by Thomas thus demonstrating the fact that both parties hold the same discourse model as truth. Both quotations recognise the power which is held by the Television and both consider it to be leading society astray.

### 4.2 Community

The ideology, Discourses and discourse models above inform the way in which the members of the eco-village live their lives, their individual behaviour and that of the group. They are embedded in the deep structure of a community dedicated to sustainable living and education. Cloughjordan eco-village fits the definition given above of a COP. It is a group of diverse and committed individuals bound by a common goal and shared sense of identity, values and norms.

- 1. I think we share a common vision and a common purpose//
- 2. Likeminded//
- 3. and I suppose is very varied we want to do things differently  $\prime\prime$
- 4. we're concerned and care, concerned about the earth//
- 5. and concerned about one another//
- 6. because I don't think you can separate the two// (Noreen)

Noreen is succinct in her description of the community within the eco-village. It is a

community which embodies a distinct culture and value system, a community which,

together, is striving toward a 'common vision'. Her description of the community captures

many of the essential elements of Eckert and McConnell-Ginets (1999) definition. Her

description of their concerns goes beyond that of the environment she emphasises the

relationships which exist within the community.

Narrative is often used in order to illuminate issues or concepts which may be quite abstract

(Gee 2005). It is generally accepted that COPs generate social capital however the generation

of social capital is an abstract concept, as such it is difficult to 'pin down'. Thomas uses

intertextuality to exhibit the depth of connection which the members of Cloughjordan

experience. The narrative involves one of the members, a professional woman, and her

reaction when stranded some thirty miles from her home in the eco-village.

- 1. She parked her car in Templemore railway station one day, to go to Dublin//
- 2. She came back to find the battery was flat//
- 3. Thirty miles from home and flat car battery //
- 4. and she suddenly thought 'this is what I like about living in Cloughjordan//
- 5. there are probably thirty numbers on that phone that I could ring //
- 6. knowing any of those people would be happy to come out and help me// (Thomas)

This offers an interesting perspective when one examines the identities at play. It begins 'one day' with a professional woman making trip to Dublin. On her return she assumes the identity of a damsel in distress. Finally she emerges unscathed as a member of the eco-village. The story demonstrates the strong interpersonal bonds and the depth of the eco-village

network. Trust, empathy and reciprocity are the foundations of relationships which in turn are

at the core of COPs (Preece 2004). The narrative conveys the existence of these qualities which Preece (2004) style as conduits of knowledge and information.

Thomas's is a strong example of how social capital operates to improve quality of life however social capital is also used to diffuse knowledge.

- 1. People will say//
- 2. 'was your floor, did it come from sustainably managed forests?' //
- 3. And I'll say that when I go into a shop//
- 4. I'm going to buy a table now in Nenagh and I asked the girl//
- 5. 'Is that from sustainably managed forest?'//
- 6. (is that what it's called?)// (Noreen)

In this extract Noreen depicts her experience of learning through a COP. She uses intertextuality in the first and second lines to impart how she became familiar with the expert term 'sustainably managed forests. Her relationship with the 'people' in this extract is one of novice (pertaining to this area, this may be reversed in another field) and she is still unsure of the term (line 6).

In addition this extract reveals an example of the type of 'norms' which are being enforced within the group. In line 2 she states that people ask about the origin of her floor, this norm is related to the local interest in 'green' products, informed by the dominant ideology and according to Putman (2000) is a method of social capital generation. This illustrates how social capital reinforces political consumerism (Neilson and Paxton 2010).

## 4.2.1 The Mythical Founder Story

Myth defined as 'a cultural code drawing together the beliefs and values of the group' (Hopkinson and Hogarth-Scott, What happened was ..." Broadening the Agenda for Storied Research 2001, 35). The members of Cloughjordan draw upon the following story<sup>10</sup> to

explain their culture and objectives.

- 1. The people who started this used to be tree huggers in the Glen//
- 2. When they tried to preserve the oaks that they were going to bring the road through//
- 3. They got talking and said//
- 4. 'we've been doing this sort of thing for years and it never works you know//
- 5. We always lose'//
- 6. So then the idea came that 'do you know what//
- 7. instead of telling them what not to do//
- 8. we'll show them what they should be doing'//
- 9. So that's how it came about//(Keith)

Keith begins with the words '[t]he people', despite knowing them personally, by doing so he furnishes them with a degree of power. It is an important story as it reflects the general ethos of Cloughjordan eco-village; a group of people fighting the odds in an effort have a positive impact on their surroundings. It alludes to education (7/8) and to the ecological aspects of the village (1); again one is reminded of Moisander and Pesonens (2002) 'resistance by not resisting'. The re-telling of this story is a clear indication of solidarity and it serves to perpetuate the community's ethos and ideology.

# 4.3 Identity

This section examines the identities of the members of the eco-village in relation to their political consumption practices and their roles within the village. It specifically focuses on impression management and the construction of identity via consumption.

When asked to describe himself Enda presents his self-image in a format common to oral story-telling called 'echoing'<sup>11</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> This story was told in three of the six interviews; they were consistent in content however linguistically each telling differed significantly.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> The later parts mimic the earlier in some way (Gee 2005)

Story - Chaos Pilot

Frame

#### Stanza 1

- 1. A chaos pilot//
- 2. culture creative //
- not content with the status quo//
  want to be different//
- 4. want to be unrefent//
- 5. cutting new ground//

Sub-story 1: Punk Rock

#### Stanza 2

- 6. I've been I like this all my life//
- 7. into punk rock not for the fashion //
- 8. but into the ethos and the DIY//
- 9. when I was 19/20//

Sub-story 2: Skate boarder

Stanza 3

- 10. I was a professional skate boarder all through my 20's//
- 11. so real part of a sub-culture which was dissed and//
- 12. not really accepted by the mainstream so//
- 13. I've been on the edge and//

Sub-story 3: The Edge

#### Stanza 4

- 14. I love the notion of our time now, this time//
- 15. where this central, centralised system //
- 16. Which doesn't respect or value the edge //
- 17. or the marginal which is where the good ideas//

#### Frame

- 19. It's also in nature the edge is the most fertile ground//
- 20. where the best ground is //
- 21. But the centre which is crumbling now //
- 22. needs to bring in the edge and the fringe//
- 23. and these ideas that have been marginalised//
- 24. to really look at where we're all going now//
- 25. So a chaos navigator // (Enda).

Enda's self-description is rich with metaphors and imagery, he is a 'chaos pilot', a 'culture creative', 'cutting new ground', this self-construction reflects his role, as a leader, within the community. He goes on to describe his progression through various stages of his life, positioning himself as a member of a dissed sub-culture. This is consistent with Leary's

(1990) prototype-matching process whereby people in a certain role will adopt the appropriate prototypic characteristics. Kirby (2003) referenced a desire to evade accepted social modes and a wish to establish oneself as an environmental consumer when discussing eco-villager motivations. Enda's description of his past, his continual desire to be different would suggest that this is his habitus, his way of being. He refers to a crumbling centralised system which could be construed as capitalism, again one is brought back to the objectives of political consumerism (humanising the capital system). There is an obvious symmetry between his words and nature. They are replete with natural imagery, 'new ground', 'fertile ground', 'growth' mirroring the ethos of Cloughjordan eco-village.

As a committed anti-consumer Thomas abhors consumerism, unethical consumers represent his undesired self. As a result he constructs an identity which is in direct contrast with mainstream consumption.

- 1. [B]eing very conscious of every purchasing decision you take//
- 2. has an environmental impact //
- 3. As you may have noticed I would not be particularly house proud//
- 4. I am not surrounded by new anything//
- 5. You won't find much new in this house at all//
- 6. you know..Variety of .. what's the word?//
- 7. second hand//
- 8. And it's not that I can't afford the new stuff// (Thomas)

Thomas refuses to be defined in the terms of modern consumption practices (as opposed to postmodern practices). In lines 1 and 2 he states his approach to consumption thus positioning himself as a political consumer. He then draws a comparison between himself and other people whom he considers to be 'house proud' in doing so he privileges his consumption discourse model. This is a method of identity construction (Dickerson 2000); he contrasts his position with that of other people, who have a different belief system<sup>12</sup>. In lines 4 and 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Within linguistics this technique is approached not as sharing of information but rather as an activity, likened to boasting (Dickerson 2000).

Thomas iterates and then reiterates his position in terms of 'new things'. Finally in line 8 he assures that he could afford new stuff, this is a restatement of his identity as an anti-consumer.

# **5** Conclusion

This research delved into the lives of six members of Cloughjordan eco-village, it was a surprising journey which revealed a strong community sustained by a robust networks and a common ideology. This paper has sought to contribute to the fields of political consumerism, eco-villages, COPs and social capital.

It is theorised that on an ideological level Cloughjordan eco-village is strongly guided by another movement, that of political consumerism. This was exposed by a critical discourse analysis of the term 'ethical consumption' in addition ardent anti-capitalism and anticonsumerism discourses emerged.

The paper goes on to classify the community in Cloughjordan eco-village a community of practice (COP); again it is patent that the values and norms of this COP are shaped by the dominant ideology. This is the first time that an eco-village as a COP has been explored and this topic warrants further study. Neilson and Paxton's (2010) contention that social capital influences political consumerism was also considered, it was found that, in this context their argument endured. High levels of social capital were witnessed within Cloughjordan eco-village.

Finally an investigation of how this ideology has been internalised by the eco-villagers depicted identities shaped by the mores and values of a postmodern movement. The outcome is a set of discourses, processes and practices which simultaneously perpetuate and feed off this ideology. The eco-villagers are both ideological promoter and consumer.

It would be interesting to research the collective identity of the eco-village, the concept of political utopia as applied to the eco-village and to study the impact of the dominant ideology (political consumerism) more closely.

# 6 Bibliography

Allen, P. and Hinrichs, C. (2007) 'Buying into 'Buy Local': Engagements of United States Local Food Initiatives', in Maye, D., Holloway, L. and Kneafsey, M. *Alternative Food Geographies: Representation and Practice*, Oxford: Elsevier, 225-272.

Arnould, E. and Thompson, C. (2005) 'Consumer Culture Theory (CCT): Twenty years of research', *Journal of Consumer Research*, 31(4), 868-882.

Barker, C. and Galasnski, D. (2001) *Cultural Studies and Discourse Analysis: A dialogue on Language and Identity*, London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Beck, R. (1983) *Motivation: Theories and Principles*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., Englewood Cliffs: Prentice-Hall.

Belk, R. (1989) 'Extended Self and Extending Paradigmatic Perspective', *Journal of Consumer Research*, 16(1), 129-132.

Binkley, S. (2009) 'The Bohemian Habitus: New Social Theory and Political Consumerism', in Soper, K., Ryle, M. and Thomas, L. (ed.) *The Politics and Pleasures of Consuming Differently*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 93-113

Bloome, D. and Egan-Robertson, A. (1993) 'The Social Construction of Intertextuality in Classroom Reading and Writing Lessons', *Reading Research Quarterly*, 28(4), 304-333.

Bossy, S. (2011) *The Utopias of Political Consumerism:The Search for Alternatives to Mass Consumption*, Reykjavik : The European Consortium of Political Research.

Bryant, R. and Goodman, M. (2011) 'Consuming Narratives: the politcal ecology of 'alternative' consumption', *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 29(3), 344-366.

Bucholtz, M. and Hall, K. (2010) 'Locating Identity in Language ', in Llamas, C. and Watt, D. *Language and Identity*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press Ltd, 18-28.

Burke, P.J. and Reitzes, D.C. (1981) 'The link between identity and role', *Social Psychology*, 44(2), 83-92.

Catterall, M. and Maclaran, P. (2006) 'Researching consumers in virtual worlds: A cyberspace odyssey', *Journal of Consumer Behaviour*, 1(3), 228-237.

Cherrier, H. (2005) 'Becoming Sensitive to Ethical Consumption Behaviour: Narratives of Survival in an Uncertain and Unpredictable World', *Advances in Consumer Research*, 32, 600-604.

Clarke, N. (2008) 'From ethical consumerism to political consumption', *Geography Compass*, 2(6), 1870-84.

Cova, B. and Cova, V. (2002) 'Tribal Marketing: The tribalisation of society and its impact on the conduct of marketing', *European Journal of Marketing*, 36(5/6), 595-620.

Crane, D. (2010) 'EnvironmentalL Change and the Future of Consumption: Implications for Consumer Identity', *Anuario filosófico*, 43(2), 353-379.

Creswell, J. (1994) *Research Design Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*, London: Sage Publications.

Dawson, J. (2006) Ecovillages. New Frontiers for Sustainability, Dartington: Green Books.

Dickerson, P. (2000) "But I'm Different to Them': Constructing Contrasts Between Self and Others in Talk-in-Interaction', *British Journal of Social Psychology*, 39(3), 381-398.

Dubuisson-Quellier, S., Lamine, C. and Le Velly, R. (2011) 'Citizenship and Consumption: Mobilisation in Alternative Food Systems in France', *Sociologia Ruralis*, 51(3), 304-324.

Dyer, G. and Wilkins, A. (1991) 'Better Stories, Not Better Constructs, to Generate Better Theory: A Rejoinder to Eisenhardt', *Academy of Management*, 16(3), 613-619.

Eckert, P. and Mcconnell-Ginet, S. (1999) 'New Generalizations and explanations in language and gender research', *Language in Society*, 28(2), 185-201.

Fairclough, N. (2003) Analysind Discourse: Textual Analysis for social research, London: Routeledge.

Flyvbjerg, B. (2006) 'Five Misunderstandings About Case-Study Research', *Qualitative Inquiry*, 12(2), 219-245.

Freestone, O. and McGoldrick, P. (2008) 'Motivations of the Ethical Consumer', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 79(4), 445–467.

Gee, J.P. (2005) *An Introduction to Discourse Analysis: Theory and Method*, Oxon: Routeledge.

Global Ecovillages Network (2011) *Global Ecovillages Network*, [Online], Available: <u>http://gen.ecovillage.org/about-gen/vision-mission.html</u> [accessed: 10 September 2011].

Gulstack Delambre, M. (2010) 'Sustainable communiites of practice and eco-villages as mediation tool for degrowth process', Second Conference on Economic Degrowth, Barcelona, 1-7.

Haanpää, L. (2007) 'Consumers' green commitment: indication of a postmodern lifestyle?', *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 31(5), 478–486.

Hargreaves, T. (2011) 'Practice-ing behaviour change: Applying social practice theory to environmental behaviour change', *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 11(1), 79-97

Hennink, M., Hutter, I. and Bailey, A. (2011) *Qualitative Research Methods*, London: Sage Publications.

Hesse-Biber, S. and Leavy, P. (2011) *The Practice of Qualitative Research*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Hobson, K. (2002) 'Competing Discourses of Sustainable Consumption: Does the 'Rationalisation of Lifestyles' Make Sense?', *Environmental Politics*,11(2), 95-120.

Hogg, M., Banister, E. and Stephenson, C. (2009) 'Mapping Symbolic (Anti-) Consumption', *Journal of Business Research*, 69(2), 148–159.

Hopkinson, G. (2003) 'Stories from the Front-line: How they Construct the Organization', *Journal of Management Studies*, 40(8), 1943–1969.

Hopkinson, G. and Hogarth-Scott, S. (2001) 'What happened was." Broadening the Agenda for Storied Research', *Journal of Marketing Management*, 17(1/2), 27-47.

Humphrey, K. (2010) Excess: anti-consumerism in the West, Cambridge: Polity Press.

Jovchelovitch, S. and Bauer, M. (2000) Narrative Interviewing, 06 June, [Online] available at

http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/2633, [accessed on September 5<sup>th</sup>, 2011]

Kilbourne, W. (2004) 'Sustainable communication and the Dominant Social Paradigm: Can They Be Integrated?', *Marketing Theory*, 4(3), 187-208.

Kilbourne, W. and Beckman, S. (1998) 'Review and Critical Assessment of Research on Marketing and the Environment', *Journal of Marketing Management*, 14(6), 513-532.

Kirby, A. (2003) 'Redefining social and environmental relations at the eco-village Ithaca: A case study', *Journal of Environmental Pyschology*, 23, 323-332.

Kleinsasser, A. (2000) 'Researchers. Reflexitivty and Good Data: Writing to Unlearn', *Theory into Practice*, 39(3), 155-162.

Leary, M. and Kowalski, R. (1999) 'Impression Management: A Literature Review and Two-Component Model', *Psychological Bulletin*, 107 (1), 34-47.

Lee, M., Motion, J. and Conroy, D. (2009) 'Anti-Consumption and Brand Avoidance', *Journal of Business Research*, 62(2), 148–159.

Levy, S. (1959) 'Symbols for Sales', Harvard Business Review, 37, 117-124.

Levy, S. (1981) 'Interpreting Consumer Mythology: A Structural Approach to Consumer Behavior', *Journal of Marketing*, 45(3), pp. 49-61.

Litfin, K. (2009) 'Reinventing the future', in Kutting, G. and Lipschute, K. (ed.) *Environmental governance: Power and knowledge in a local-global world*, London: Routeledge.

Macchiette, B. and Roy, A. (1994) 'Sensitive Groups and Social Issues: Are You Marketing Correct?', *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 11(4), 55-64.

Maykut, P. and Morehouse, R. (1994) *Beginning qualitative research: A philosophical and practical guide*, London: The Falmer Press.

McCracken, G. (1986) 'Culture and Consumption: A Theoretical Account of the Structure and Movement of the Cultural Meaning of Consumer Goods', *Journal of Consumer Research*, 13(1), 71-84.

McCracken (1988) *Culture and consumption: New approaches to the symbolic character of consumer goods and activities*, Bloomington: Indiana University.

McGlynn, P. (1972) 'Graffiti & Slogans: Flushing the Id', *The Journal of Popular Culture*, VI(2), 351–356.

Micheletti, M. and Follesdal, A. (2007) 'Shopping for Human Rights. An Introduction to the Special Issue', *Journal of Consumer Policy*, 30(3), 167–175.

Moisander, J. and Pesonen, S. (2002) 'Narratives of sustainable ways of living: constructing the self and the as a green consumer', *Management Decision*, 40(4), 329-342.

Moraesa, C., Szmigin, I. and Carrigan, M. (2010) 'Living Production-Engaged Alternatives: An Examination of New Consumption Communities', *Markets & Culture*, 13(3), pp. 273-298.

Morgan, K. (2010) 'Local and Green, Global and Fair: The Ethical Foodscape and the Politics of Fair', *Environment and Planning A*, 42(8), 1852 -1867.

Nahapiet, J. and Ghoshal, S. (1998) 'Social Capital, Intellectual Capital, and the Organizational Advantage', *The Academy of Management Review*, 23(2), 242-266.

Neilson, L. and Paxton, P. (2010) 'Social Capital and Political Consumerism: A Multilevel Analysis', *Source: Social Problems*, 57(1), 5-24.

Newholm, T. and Shaw, D. (2007) 'Studying the Ethical Consumer: A Review of Research', *Journal of Consumer Behaviour*, September, 253-270.

North, P. (2010) 'Eco-localisation as a progressive response to peak oil a critique', *Geoforum*, 41(4), 585-594.

Opp, K.-D. (2009) *Theories of political protest and social movements: a multidisciplinary introduction, critique, and synthesis,* London: Routeledge.

Pierre, J. (2005) 'Comparative Urban Governance. Uncovering Complex Causalities', *Urban Affairs Review*, 40(4), 446-462.

Portes, A. (1998) 'Social Capital: Its Origins and Applications in Modern Sociology', *Annual Review of Sociology*, 24, 1-24.

Preece, J. (2004) 'Etiquette, Empathy and Trust in Communities of Practice: Stepping-Stones to Social Capital1', *Journal of Universal Computer Science*, 10(3), 294-302.

Prothero, A., McDonagh, P. and Dobscha, S. (2010) 'Is Green the New Black? Reflections on a Green Commodity Discourse', *Journal of Macromarketing*, 30(2), 147-159.

Putman, R. (2000) *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of Americal Community*, New York: Simon & Schuster.

Ritzer, G. (2005) 2005. Enchanting a Disenchanted World: Revolutionizing the Means of Consumption, Thousand Oaks, CA: Pine Forge Press.

Sandıkc, Ö. and Ekici, A. (2008) 'Politically Motivated Brand Rejection', *Journal of Business Research*, 62(2), 208–217.

Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A. (2009) *Research Methods for Business Students*, 5<sup>th</sup> edition, London: Pearson Education.

Shaw, D. and Clarke, I. (1999) 'Belief formation in ethical consumer groups: an exploratory study', *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 17(2), 109 - 119.

Shaw, D. and Riach, K. (2011) 'Embracing ethical fields:constructing consumption in the', *European Journal of Marketing*,45(7/8), 1051-1067.

Szmigin, I., Carrigan, M. and McEachern, M. (2009) 'The conscious consumer: taking a flexible approach to ethical behaviour.', International Journal of Consumer Studies, 33(2) 224-231.

Spiggle, S. (1994) 'Analysis and Interpretation of Qualitative Data in Consumer Research', *Journal of Consumer Research*, 21(3), 491-503.

Stake, R. (1995) The Art of Case Study Research, London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Stark, H. and Brown Trinidad, S. (2007) 'Choose Your Method: A Comparison of Phenomenology, Discourse Analysis, and Grounded Theory', *Qualitative Health Research*, 17(10), 1372-1380.

Stolle, D., Hooghe, M. and Micheletti, M. (2003) *Political Consumerism – A New Phenomenon of Political Participation?*, Edinburgh: European Consortium of Political Research.

The Village (2010) *the village*, 1 January, [Online], Available: <u>http://thevillage.ie</u> [ accessed on: 2 June 2011].

Thompson, C., Locander, W. and Pollio, H. (1989) 'Putting Consumer Experience Back into Consumer Research: The Philosophy and Method of Existential-Phenomenology', *Journal of Consumer Research*, 16(2), 133-146.

Van Dijk, T. (1995) 'Discourse Semantics and Ideology', Discourse & Society, 6(2), 243-289.

Village, T. (2011) *The Village*, [Online], Available: <u>http://thevillage.ie/</u> [ accessed on: 5 August 2011].

Weedon, C. (1987) Feminist Practice & Poststuralist Theory, Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Wenger, E. (2000) 'Communities of Practice and Social Learning Systems', *Organization*, 7(2), 225-246.

Wodak, R. (1995) 'Critical linguistics and Critical Discourse Analysis', in Östman, J.-O., Ledin, P. and Verschueren, J. *Discursive Pragmatics*, Amsterdam: John Benejamins Publishing Co.

Woodruff, A., Hasbrouck, J. and Augustin, S. (2008) 'A bright green perspective on sustainable choices', Green Day, Florence, 313-322.

Yin, R. (1981) 'The Case Study Crisis: Some Answers', *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 26(1), 58-65.

Yin, R. (2009) Case Study Research: Design and Methods, London: Sage Publications.

	<b>Significance:</b> What are the situated meanings on some of the words which seem important in this situation? What situated meanings and values seem to attached to places, times, bodies, people, objects, artefacts, and institutions relevant in this situation. What situated meanings and values are attached to other texts quoted or alluded to in the situation (interextuality)? What discourse models seem to be at play in connecting and integrating these situated meanings to each other? What institutions and/or discourses are being (re)produced into his situation and how are they being stabilised or transformed in the act?	Activities. What are the larger or main activity (or set of activities) going on in the situation? What sub-activities compose this activity (or these activities)? What actions compose these sub- activities and activities?	<b>Identities:</b> What identities (roles/positions), with their concomitant personal, social and cultural knowledge and beliefs (cognition), feelings (affect) and values seem to be relevant to, taken for granted in, or under construction in the situation? How are these identities stabilised or transformed in the situation? In terms of identities, activities and relationships what Discourses are relevant (and irrelevant) in the situation? How are they made relevant (and irrelevant) and in what ways?
Ethical consumer' takes on a specific meaning within CJ EV, it is just the beginning of the journey within CJ EV, it is just the beginning of the journey it's like a light green and it's like a light green	Ethical consumer' takes on a specific meaning within CJ EV, it is just the beginning of the journey to being a deep green thinker, it is light green and this not the preferable way to be there	It is important for the informant that is recognised that he is engaged in Political consumerism, which in this case is an activity. In addition at the moment he is being interviewed - he is aware of his role an ambassador - his language reflects this activity.	The informant's identity as a 'deep green thinker' is being constructed in this piece of discourse- no longer merely a consumer. The words 'I tend' illustrate that this is an on-going, enduring state - a part of his habitus (it is an habitual aspect marker)
it's like "don't worry about the system, you don't need to change it you just need to shop differently",	His discourse model is that ethical consumption alone is insufficient - one should be more than a mere consumer trying to change an inequitable system by shopping.	Critiquing society and the way in which ethical consumption works	Evaluative statement - his opinion thus positioning himself as an expert. In this statement he is contrasting his behaviour with that of others - separating himself from them.
you know so an ethical consumerof course, I'm an ethical consumer, I'll chose fair trade, I want to have relationship with the people who produce my food these are ethical things.	Being an ethical consumer is significant in that he supports fair trade 'of course' but it's significance within the broader discourse of political consumerism is limited - it's a given.	Localisation is an other activity which is being referenced here - he wants it to be acknowledged i that ethical consumption means a lot more than looking at tags but includes localisation and anti consumption	His identity as a localist is also being constructed in this piece of language.
I want to avoid things that have had a lot of energy spent on them, high energy goods, that's an ethical consumer.	Anti-consumption framed as ethical consumption - Activity - anti-consumption they are different concepts - he previously describes 'ethical consumption' as in what was meant in the question		He is more than an ethical consumer - speaking the personal pronoun 'I' helps to build an identity - in this case as a 'deep green thinker'. He also disassociates himself from people who do not avoid these goods etc. they represent his undesired self.
But that's always a process of learning I mean we're not just looking, it's not just buying fair trade instead of normal coffee it is about thinking a bit deeper about these things and how we use our pound or euro.	this reflects the values associated with political consumerism - as a movement. Also the fair trade discourse is also drawn on here (intertextuality) - the term 'fair trade' carries more meaning in this piece of language than merely buying fair trade, it asks that people think about the source of their food in general and a result the whole system.	The social activity = political consumerism. Also he The fair trade discourse is relevant to his identity implies that people learn as they go along. his role as a promoter of 'clean food'. Also he refers to it as a learning process - 'we're not' he is positioning himself as someone involved in this learning process - an educator	The fair trade discourse is relevant to his identity - his role as a promoter of 'clean food'. Also he refers to it as a learning process - 'we're not' he is positioning himself as someone involved in this learning process - an educator

# 7 Appendix 1

	Relationships: What sorts of social relationships seem to be relevant to, taken for granted in or under construction in the situation? How are these relationships stabilised or transformed in the situation? How are oral or other texts quoted or alluded to so as to set up certain relationships to other texts, people or Discourses? In terms of identities, activities and relationships what Discourses are relevant (and irrelevant) in the situation? How are they made relevant (and irrelevant) and in what ways?	Politics (the distribution of social goods): What Sories (What sorts of connections looking social goods (status, power, aspects of gender, race and class or more narrowly defined social networks and identities) are relevant (or interaction? What sorts of connections are made irrelevant (or networks and identities) are relevant (or networks and interaction? How are they made to previous or future interactions, to other relevant or otherwise and in what ways? How are people, ideas, texts, things, institutions and these social goods connected to the discourses outside the current situation? I no devit intertextuality)? How is intertextuality induces and discourses operative in this situation? I no do with intertextuality)? How is intertextuality induces and discourses operative in this situation? I no do with intertextuality)? How is intertextuality is not different Discourses? How do above connections help to constitute "coherence" and what sort of "coherence" in the situation?	<b>Connections:</b> What sorts of connections looking backwards and/or forwards are me within and across utterances and large stretches of the interaction? What sorts of connections are made to previous or future interactions, to other people, ideas, texts, things, institutions and Discourses outside the current situation (this has to do with intertextuality)? How is intertextuality interde to reate connections among the current bistourses? How do above connections help to constitute "coherence" in the situation?	Sign Systems and knowledge: What sign systems are relevant or irrelevant in the situation? How are they made relevant or otherwise and in what ways? What systems of knowing are relevant or irrelevant in the situation? How are they made relevant or otherwise and in what ways? What languages in the sense of "national" languages are relevant or irrelevant in the situation? What social languages in the sense of "national" languages are relevant or irrelevant or irrelevant in the situation? How are they made relevant or otherwise and in what ways? How is intertextuality used to engage with the above listues?
I tend not to like term [ethical consumer] because it's like a light green	The relevant relationship here is between interviewee and interviewer - he has an opinion interviewee and interviewer - he has an opinion interviewee and interviewer - he has an opinion interviewee and interviewer - he has an opinion which he wishes to express, the language he uses it's like a light green	His beliefs are at stake here - he believes that ethical consumption is a starting point and is not sufficiently deep green. His opinions are also being highlighted - he wants	in a way he disconnects ethical consumption from Light green '/Deep green are a way of living and deep green thought. He disconnects it as a the interviewee uses deep green thinking to define his identity - he privilges deep green thinking and and antity - he privilges deep green thinking and interviewee uses deep green thinking to define his identity - he privilges deep green thinking and simultaneously, denigrate light green thinking and indeed the 'normal' or 'mainstream' consumption discourses	Light green / /Deep green' are a way of living and the interviewee uses deep green thinking to define his identity - here he privilege dep green thinking and simultaneously, denigrate light green thinking and indeed the 'normal' or 'mainstream' consumption discourses
it's like "don't worry about the system, you don't need to change it you just need to shop differently",	His relationship with those who are saying that shopping is the way forward is negative - he holds them in disdain and implue that they are misleading the public. The public are portrayed as naive - they think they are doing the best they can but they are being misled	The blame is taken from the ethical consumers and placed on some other entity. The ethical consumer is taken to have the right motives - even if they are lazy or thoughtless about it. The dominant ideology consumerism is given power here	here he makes a connection between 'the system' and consumption, in doing so he connects his own beliefs of anti-consumerism to ethical consumers.	Denigrate capitalism and consumerism
you know so an ethical consumerof course, I'm an ethical consumer, I'll chose fair trade, I want to have relationship with the people who produce my food these are ethical things,	He wants to have a relationship with the people who produce his food.	Within CJ being perceived as a certain type of consumer is a social good - something worth having , as are relationships with food producers (hence the farm which is run there). Here he ensures that these are things he values and is in	he makes a connection between himself and the people who produce his food.	privileges localisation, anti-consumption, he is passionate about how is food is produced his dialect and way of speech reflects this.
I want to avoid things that have had a lot of energy spent on them, high energy goods, that's an ethical consumer.			he connects ethical consumption with localists, anti consumption and fair trade. These are different discourses - intertextuality. He also refers to the amount of energy used - thereby calling on a further discourse which related to amount of energy being used - environmentalism.	He offers a definition of ethical consumer which is broader than originally proffered. He therefore privileges 'his' form of ethical consumption.
But that's always a process of learning I mean we're not just looking, it's not just buying fair trade instead of normal coffee it is about thinking a bit deeper about these things and how we use our pound or euro.	we're not just looking' Plural pronoun - a relationship is referenced between the informant and those promoting deep green thought - more than ethical consumption. Between himself and the movement that is political consumption. In addition he would like to have a 'role model' relationship with the people about whom he is	Begins by saying what he (as part of a collective) he connects th wants to change the way in which things are done consumerism. - change the power relations. A society in which people think about their food consumption is a social good here.	he connects thinking deeply and political consumerism.	